BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10631510 4

Cases on Evidence
(1987-88 Edition)

Volume 2

Selected by Alan W. Mewett

These materials are intended for use in the Evidence course of Professor Mewett in the Faculty of Law of the University of Toronto.

LAW LIBRARY

SEP 9 1987

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

Cases on Evidence
(1987-88 Edition)

Volume 2

Selected by Alan W. Mewett

These materials are intended for use in the Evidence course of Professor Mewett in the Faculty of Law of the University of Toronto.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Statutes	Page
Charter of Rights	1
Canada Evidence Act	2
Evidence Act of Ontario	10
1. Introduction	
Batary v. A.G. Sask., [1965] S.C.R. 465	24
Bruno (1976), 27 C.C.C.(2d) 318	28
Pappajohn (1980), 14 C.R.(3d) 243	29
Oakes (1983), 2 C.C.C.(3d) 339	33
Morris (1984), 36 C.R.(3d) 1	41
2. Competence, Compellability and Oaths	
Gosselin (1907), 7 C.C.C. 139	50
McConnell and Beer, [1968] S.C.R. 802	53
Vezeau, [1977] 2 S.C.R. 277	57
Hoskyn v. M.P.C., [1978] 2 W.L.R. 695	58
Bowles (1967), 50 C.R. 353	59
Sillars (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 202	61
Czipps (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 193	63
McNamara (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 210	67
Fellichle (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 207	70
Agawa (1975), 31 C.R.N.S. 293	72
McLaughlin (1974), 24 C.R.N.S. 362	73
Walsh (1979), 45 C.C.C.(2d) 199	77
Gunewardene, [1951] 2 K.B. 600	81
Toohey v. M.P.C., [1965] A.C. 595	83
Hawke (1975), 29 C.R.N.S. 1	87
Sankey (1927), 48 C.C.C. 97	92
Budin (1981), 58 C.C.C.(2d) 352 (Ont.C.A.)	94
Kendall, [1962] S.C.R. 469	96
3. Refreshing Memory	
McInroy and Rouse (1977), 5 C.R.(3d) 125	98
Davey (1969), 6 C.R.N.S. 288	101
Bengert (1980), 15 C.R.(3d) 21; 15 C.R.(3d) 114 at 160	104
4. Credibility	
(a) Expert Evidence	
Wilband, [1967] 2 C.C.C. 6	106
Rosik (1971), 13 C.R.N.S. 129	108
Abbey (1982), 43 N.R. 30	116
Phillion (1977), 37 C.R.N.S. 361	122
(b) Enhancing Credibility	
Clark (1984), 40 C.R.(3d) 183	126
Kyselka, [1962] O.W.N. 164	132
Corke v. Corke, [1958] 1 All E.R. 224	133
Welstead v. Brown, [1952] 1 S.C.R. 3	135
Pappin (1970), 12 C.R.N.S. 287 (Ont.C.A.).	137
Rozich (1980), 10 C.R.(3d) 364	138
Giraldi (1975), 28 C.C.C.(2d) 248	141
(c) Complaints in Sexual Cases	
Sexual Offences Act	144
Timm (1981), 59 C.C.C.(2d) 396 (S.C.C.)	144
Page (1984), 40 C.R.(3d) 85	147
(d) Prior Inconsistent Statements	
Deacon (1947), S.C.R. 531	152
McInroy and Rouse, [1979] 1 S.C.R. 588	153
Wawanesa v. Hanes, [1961] O.R. 495	158
Milgaard (1971), 14 C.R.N.S. 34	161
Cronshaw (1977), 3 C.C.C.(2d) 183 (Prov.Ct.)	165

Credibility (contd) — Page

(e) Prior Convictions

Criminal Code s.593	166
D'Aoust (1902), 5 C.C.C. 407	166
Koufis (1941), S.C.R. 481	167
Titchner, [1961] O.R. 606	168
St. Pierre (1974), 17.C.C.C.(2d) 489	170
Morris (1979), 43 C.C.C.(2d) 129	172

(f) Prior Sexual Conduct

Criminal Code ss. 246.6, 246.7	183
Laliberte, [1877] 1 S.C.R. 117	184
Forsythe (1980), 15 C.R.(3d) 219	186

(g) Accused Attacking own Credibility

French (1978), 37 C.C.C.(2d) 201	191
Helpard (1979), 10 C.R.(3d) 76	196
Dietrich (1970), 11 C.R.N.S. 129	198
R. v. K. (1979), 47 C.C.C.(2d) 436	203

5. Character

McNamara (1981) 56 C.C.C.(2d) 193	208
Guay (1978), 42 C.C.C.(2d) 536	215
Taylor (1982), 35 O.R.(2d) 738 (Ont.C.A.)	217
Glynn (1971), 15 C.R.N.S. 343	219
Lupien (1970), 9 C.R. 165	220
Lowery, [1973] 3 W.L.R. 235	225
McMillan (1975), 29 C.R.N.S. 191	230
Robertson (1975), 29 C.R.N.S. 141	235

6. Similar Fact Evidence

Criminal Code Section 312, 314(1)(b), 317, 318	237
Makin, [1894] A.C. 57	238
Smith (1916), 11 Cr. Ap. Rep. 229	241
Sweitzer (1982), 68 C.C.C.(2d) 193	242
Boardman, [1975] A.C. 421	246
Leblanc (1975), 29 C.C.C.(2d) 97	250
Cloutier (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 10	254
Straffen, [1952] 2 Q.B. 911	260
Scopelliti (1982), 63 C.C.C.(2d) 481	263
MacDonald v. Canada Kelp (1974), 39 D.L.R.(3d) 617	270
Hoffman article, (1975), 91 L.Q.R. 193	275

7. Hearsay

(i) General

Myers v. D.P.P., [1965] A.C. 1001	284
Ares v. Venner, [1970] S.C.R. 608	289
Subramaniam, [1956] 1 W.L.R. 965	291
Wright v. Tatham (1837), 112 E.R. 488	293
Wysochan (1930), 54 C.C.C. 172	296
Wildman (1984), 14 C.C.C.(3d) 321	298
Ratten, [1972] A.C. 378	308

(ii) Res Gestae

Bedingfield (1879), 14 Cox C.C. 341	312
Gilbert (1907), 38 S.C.R. 284	314
Leland, [1951] O.R. 12	316
Hodd (1970), 1 C.C.C.(3d) 363	321
Graham (1972), 7 C.C.C.(2d) 93	325
Newton (1976), 34 C.R.N.S. 161	330
Risby (1977), 32 C.C.C.(2d) 242	332
Keeler (1978), 36 C.C.C.(2d) 8	333
Clark (1983), 35 C.R.(3d) 357	336

(iii) Statements Against Interest

Donnelly v. U.S. (1913), 228 U.S. 243	352

Hearsay (contd) — Page

Agawa (1975), 31 C.R.N.S. 293 — 354
Demeter (1977), 35 C.C.C.(2d) 137 — 357
O'Brien (1977), 35 C.C.C.(2d) 209 — 359
Pelletier (1978), 38 C.C.C.(2d) 515 — 362
Lucier (1982), 65 C.C.C.(2d) 150 — 364

(iv) Prior Proceedings

Criminal Code S.S. 643, 541 — 366
Walkerton v. Erdman (1894), 23 S.C.R. 352 — 367
Hollington v. Hewthorn (1943), 1 K.B. 587 — 370
Goody v. Odhams Press, [1967] 1 Q.B. 333 — 374
Gushue (1980), 50 C.C.C.(2d) 417 — 374
Grdic (1985), 3 C.C.C. (3d) 379 — 379
English v. Richmond, [1956] S.C.R. 383 — 387
Re Charlton, [1969] C.C.C. (2d)] — 390
Humphrys, [1976] 2 All E.R. 497 — 392
Prince, (1986) 9 C.C.C. (3d) 155 — 394
Kienapple (1974), 15 C.C.C. (2d) 524 — 402

(v) Bodily & Mental Condition

Youlden (1912), 260 L.R. 75 — 404
Mutual Life v. Hillmon (1892), 145 U.S. 285 — 406
Wainwright (1875), 13 Cox C.C. 171 — 408
Thomson, [1912] 3 K.B. 19 — 409
Home v. Corbeil, [1955] 4 D.L.R. 750 — 410
Blastland — 412

(vi) Business Records

Vanlerberghe (1979), 6 C.R.(3d) 222 — 421
McMullen (1979), 47 C.C.C.(2d) 499 — 422
Civil Evidence Act (U.K.); Computer Evidence (S.Africa) — 428
Wood (1983), 76 Cr.App.R. 23 — 429

8. Confessions and Pre-Trial Statements

(i) General

Piché (1971), S.C.R. 23 — 432

(ii) Persons in Authority

Towler (1968), 5 C.R.N.S. 55 — 435
Pettipiece (1972), 18 C.R.N.S. 236 — 436
Rothman (1981), 1 S.C.R. 640 — 440
Collins (1976), 29 C.C.C.(2d) 304 — 443
Perras (1973), 11 C.C.C.(2d) 245 — 445
Stewart (1980), 54 C.C.C.(2d) 93 — 447

(iii) The Voir Dire

Thiffault (1933), 60 C.C.C. 97 — 450
Kacherowski (1978), 37 C.C.C.(2d) 257 — 452
Conkie (1978), 38 C.C.C.(2d) 408 — 454
Wert (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 254 — 456

(iv) Need for Voir Dire

Sweezey (1974), 27 C.R.N.S. 163 — 457
Powell (1976), 33 C.R.N.S. 323 — 459
Erven (1979), 6 C.R.(3d) 97 — 461
Morris (1979), 10 C.R.(3d) 59 — 472
Boulet (1977), 34 C.C.C.(2d) 345 — 475
Watson (1980), 1 W.L.R. 991 — 477
Price (1981) 59 C.C.C.(2d) 367 (Ont.Co.Ct.) — 480
Park (1981), 59 C.C.C.(2d) 385 (S.C.C.) — 482

(v) Timing of the Voir Dire

Bruno (1976), 27 C.C.C.(2d) 318 — 486

Confessions etc. (contd).

Page

(vi) Voluntariness

Ibrahim, [1914] A.C. 599 487
Horvath (1979), 44 C.C.C.(2d) 385 490
Prager (1972), 1 All E.R. 1114 498
Serack (1973), 24 C.R.N.S. 295 500
Washer (1948), 92 C.C.C. 218 501
Ward (1979), 7 C.R.(3d) 153 502
Zanella (1981), 55 C.C.C.(2d) 567 505
Nagotcha (1980), 51 C.C.C.(2d) 353 508
Rothman (1981), 35 N.R. 485 509
Amato (1983), 69 C.C.C.(2d) 31 513
Griffin (1981), 59 C.C.C.(2d) 503 516
Marshall (1960), 127 C.C.C. 76 519

(vii) Charter Cases

Crossman v. The Queen (1984), 12 C.C.C.(3d) 547 521
Anderson (1984), 10 C.C.C.(3d) 417 528
Lessard (1984), 10 C.C.C.(3d) 62 536
Manninen (1983) 551

(viii) Truth of Confession

Hammond, [1941] 3 All E.R. 318 557
Hnedish (1958), 26 W.W.R. 685 559
De Clerq, [1968] S.C.R. 902 561
Wong Kam-Ming, [1979] 2 W.L.R. 81 565

(ix) Confessions Confirmed by Subsequent Facts

St. Lawrence (1949), 93 C.C.C. 376 570
Wray (1970), 11 C.R.N.S. 235 573

(x) Use of Confessions

Jackson (1980), 57 C.C.C.(2d) 154 580
Herodotu (1979), 6 C.R.(3d) 336 585
Ma, Ho and Lai (1979), 6 C.R.(3d) 325. 589

(xi) Use of Voir Dire evidence at Trial

Van Dongen (1975), 31 C.R.N.S. 346 593
Gauthier (1976), 33 C.R.N.S. 46 595
Magdish (1978) 41 C.C.C.(2d) 392 598
Brophy (1981), 2 All E.R. 705 599
Tarrant (1982), 63 C.C.C.(2d) 385 602

(xii) Adopted Statements and Silence

Chapdelaine (1935), 63 C.C.C.5 604
Fargnoli, [1957] O.R. 140 605
Govedarov (1974), 16 C.C.C.(2d) 238 606
Eden, [1970] 3 C.C.C.280 607
Sweeney (1977), 35 C.C.C.(2d) 245 609
Christie, [1914] A.C. 545 612
Sayegh (No.3) (1982), 69 C.C.C.(2d) 84 614
Parkes (1977), 64 Cr.App.R. 25 616
Gottschall (1983), 10 C.C.C.(2d) 447 617

(xiii) Consciousness of Guilt and Lies

Burdick (1975) 27 C.C.C. (2d) 497 630
Sparrow (1979), 12 C.R. (3d) 158 633

(xiv) Conditional Admissibility

Carter (1982), 67 C.C.C. (2d) 568 635

(xv) Guilty Plea

Dietrich (1970) 11 C.R.N.S. 22 639
Rimmer (1972), 1 All E.R. 604 641
Pentiluk (1975), 28 C.R.N.S. 324 643

9. Admissions

Divorce Act, s.9 645

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/casesonevidence02mewe_4

Admissions (contd)	Page
Yorkton v. Morley (1967), 66 D.L.R.(2d) 37	645
Strand Electric, [1969] 2 C.C.C. 264	647
10. Privilege	
Slavutych v. Baker (1977), 38 C.R.N.S. 306	649
Descoteaux v. Mierzwinski (1982), 44 N.R. 462	653
Shenton v. Tyler, [1939] Ch. 620	657
Rumping v. D.P.P., [1962] 3 All E.R. 256	659
St. Jean (1976), 34 C.R.N.S. 378	661
Akey (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 240	663
Jean (1979), 7 C.R.(3d) 333; (1980) 16 C.R.(3d) 193	666
Lloyd (1982), 64 C.C.C.(2d) 169	668
Reference re Legislative Privilege (1978), 39 C.C.C.(2d) 222	670
Health Records (1982), 62 C.C.C.(2d) 193	674
11. State Secrets	
Duncan v. Cammell, Laird, [1942] A.C. 624	678
Conway v. Rimmer, [1963] A.C. 910	682
Mannix (1982), 126 D.L.R.(3d) 155	686
Re Goguen (1982) 10 C.C.C. (3d) 492	689
Canada Evidence Act Sections 36.1 to 36.3	699
12. Improperly Obtained Evidence	
Kuruma, [1955] A.C. 197	701
Sang, [1980] A.C. 402	703
Lawrie v. Muir, [1950] S.L.T. 37	707
Bunning v. Cross (1978), 52 A.L.J.R. 561	708
Criminal Code Sections 178.16, 178.2	709
Stewart (1981), 60 C.C.C.(2d) 407	711
Dass (1979), 47 C.C.C.(2d) 194	713
Goldman (1979), 51 C.C.C.(2d) 1	714
Hogan (1979), 18 C.C.C.(2d) 65	718
12a. Charter Cases	
Hunter v. Southam (1984) 14 C.C.C. (3d) 97	724
Rao (1984) 12 C.C.C. (3d) 97	734
13. Corroboration	
Criminal Code Sections 246.4, 586	752
Baskerville, [1916] 2 K.B. 658	752
Ethier, [1959] O.R. 533	754
Hester, [1972] 3 All E.R. 1056	757
Kilbourne, [1973] 1 All E.R. 440	760
Warkentin (1976), 30 C.C.C.(2d) 1	764
Vetrovec (1982), 67 C.C.C.(2d) 1	768
14. Real Evidence	
Yachuk v. Blaise, [1944] O.W.N. 412	778
Draper v. Jacklyn, [1968] 2 O.R. 683	779
Parsons (1977), 40 C.R.N.S. 202	781
15. Judicial Notice	
Varcoe v. Lee (1919), 180 Cal. 338	784
Savidant (1945), 19 M.P.R. 448	788
16. Miscellaneous Problems in the Trial Process	
Cooper (1977), 34 C.C.C.(2d) 18	790
LeMay, [1952] 1 S.C.R. 232	796
Browne v. Dunn (1893), 6 R. 67	800
Dyck, [1970] 2 C.C.C. 283	802
Mete (1973), 22 C.R.N.S. 387	803
Angelantoni (1975), 31 C.R.N.S. 342	806
Dobberthien (1973), 13 C.C.C.(2d) 513	807
Sparre (1978), 37 C.C.C.(2d) 495	811